

Authors' contributions

PL – study concept and design; acquisition of data; analysis and interpretation of data; drafting of the manuscript; critical revision of the manuscript for important intellectual content; statistical analysis. YZ, TH, ML, JA, MOM, MO – acquisition of data; critical revision of the manuscript for important intellectual content. HY – study concept and design; analysis and interpretation of data; drafting of the manuscript; critical revision of the manuscript for important intellectual content; obtained funding; study supervision.

Acknowledgements

We thank Anne Salo, Aila Karioja-Kallio, Mia Urjansson, Katja Sohlo, Erja Juvonen, Anna-Liisa Ruskeepää, Ulla Lahtinen, Heli Nygren and Ismo Mattila for their excellent technical assistance.

References

Author names in bold designate shared co-first authorship

[1] **Luukkonen PK, Zhou Y**, Sädevirta S, Leivonen M, Arola J, Orešič M, et al. Hepatic ceramides dissociate steatosis and insulin resistance in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. *J Hepatol* 2016;64:1167–1175.

[2] Buch S, Stickel F, Trépo E, Way M, Herrmann A, Nischalke HD, et al. A genome-wide association study confirms PNPLA3 and identifies TM6SF2 and MBOAT7 as risk loci for alcohol-related cirrhosis. *Nat Genet* 2015;47:1443–1448.

[3] **Mancina RM, Dongiovanni P**, Petta S, Pingitore P, Meroni M, Rametta R, et al. The MBOAT7-TMC4 variant rs641738 increases risk of nonalcoholic fatty liver disease in individuals of european descent. *Gastroenterology* 2016;150:1219–1230 e6.

[4] D'Souza K, Epanand RM. Enrichment of phosphatidylinositols with specific acyl chains. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 2014;1838:1501–1508.

[5] Angulo P, Kleiner DE, Dam-Larsen S, Adams LA, Björnsson ES, Charatcharoen-witthaya P, et al. Liver fibrosis, but no other histologic features, is associated with long-term outcomes of patients with nonalcoholic fatty liver disease. *Gastroenterology* 2015;149:389–397 e10.

[6] Ekstedt M, Hagström H, Nasr P, Fredrikson M, Stål P, Kechagias S, et al. Fibrosis stage is the strongest predictor for disease-specific mortality in NAFLD after up to 33 years of follow-up. *Hepatology* 2015;61:1547–1554.

[7] Anderson KE, Kielkowska A, Durrant TN, Juvin V, Clark J, Stephens LR, et al. Lysophosphatidylinositol-acyltransferase-1 (LPIAT1) is required to maintain physiological levels of PtdIns and PtdInsP(2) in the mouse. *PLoS One* 2013;8:e58425.

[8] Rong X, Wang B, Dunham MM, Hedde PN, Wong JS, Gratton E, et al. Lpcat3-dependent production of arachidonoyl phospholipids is a key determinant of triglyceride secretion. *Elife* 2015;4.

[9] Pérez-Chacón G, Astudillo AM, Balmora D, Balboa MA, Balsinde J. Control of free arachidonic acid levels by phospholipases A2 and lysophospholipid acyltransferases. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 2009;1791:1103–1113.

[10] Loomba R, Quehenberger O, Armando A, Dennis EA. Polyunsaturated fatty acid metabolites as novel lipidomic biomarkers for noninvasive diagnosis of nonalcoholic steatohepatitis. *J Lipid Res* 2015;56:185–192.

Panu K. Luukkonen^{1,7,*}
 You Zhou^{1,6,7}
 Tuulia Hyötyläinen⁵
 Marja Leivonen²
 Johanna Arola³
 Marju Orho-Melander⁴
 Matej Orešič⁵
 Hannele Yki-Järvinen^{1,7}

¹Department of Medicine, University of Helsinki, Helsinki University Hospital, Helsinki, Finland

²Department of Surgery, University of Helsinki, Helsinki University Hospital, Helsinki, Finland

³Department of Pathology, University of Helsinki, Helsinki University Hospital, Helsinki, Finland

⁴University of Lund, Malmö, Sweden

⁵Steno Diabetes Center, Gentofte, Denmark

⁶Systems Immunity University Research Institute and Division of Infection and Immunity, School of Medicine, Cardiff University, Cardiff, United Kingdom

⁷Minerva Foundation Institute for Medical Research, Helsinki, Finland

*Corresponding author. Address: University of Helsinki and Helsinki University Hospital, Department of Medicine, Tukholmantatu 8, 00290 Helsinki, Finland. Tel.: +358 2 9412 5708; fax: +358 9 4717 1896. E-mail address: panu.luukkonen@fimnet.fi



Establishing the independence and clinical importance of non-alcoholic fatty liver disease as a risk factor for cardiovascular disease

To the Editor:

The evaluation of the nature of the association between non-alcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD) and cardiovascular risk has been the topic of a number of reports. There is emerging consensus that NAFLD is positively correlated with increased cardiovascular risk and several groups have indicated that this is independent of known risk factors [1]. The importance of this

association is underlined by the observation that cardiovascular disease is a leading cause of death in individuals with NAFLD [2,3].

To further illuminate this topic two recent papers have been published in the *Journal of Hepatology*. The first of these comes from the LIDO Study Group and assesses the impact of hepatic steatosis on the incidence and development of carotid

Letters to the Editor

atherosclerosis [4]. Using the fatty liver index to define hepatic steatosis the authors examined associations with both carotid intima-media thickness (C-IMT) and the development of carotid plaques. In multivariable analyses hepatic steatosis was independently associated with C-IMT in a model that included a discontinuous measure of hypertension, type 2 diabetes, smoking, and age. The second paper is a systematic review and meta-analysis of studies reporting associations between NAFLD and cardiovascular events [5]. This synthesises data from 16 studies and there are several striking observations. The study designs whilst falling broadly under the term non-randomised display remarkable heterogeneity as evidenced by the high I^2 values. For instance, there are studies with both prospective and retrospective designs, studies recruiting from inpatient and outpatient settings, and endpoints that vary from in-hospital cardiovascular events only to all-cause mortality. In addition, there is little difference in the pooled odds ratio for all studies combined and the minority of those will full adjustment of confounders. This is perhaps surprising given the attenuation that one would expect with adjustment of confounding factors including age, smoking, type 2 diabetes, systolic blood pressure, and body mass index (BMI).

These studies illustrate some of the challenges of determining the independence and clinical importance of the excess cardiovascular risk that may be associated with NAFLD above that of all the associated comorbid risk factors. As an example of this the use of the fatty liver index as a surrogate of hepatic steatosis raises significant questions regarding the conclusions of the study from Pais and colleagues since one of its components – waist circumference – itself is an established cardiovascular risk factor. Indeed, when the individual components of the fatty liver index were considered in the multivariable analysis the strength of the association between C-IMT and waist circumference was similar to that of hepatic steatosis. Waist circumference acts in cardiovascular risk prediction as a surrogate of abdominal and visceral (including hepatic) adipose tissue. Whilst it is possible that hepatic steatosis is the key abnormality associated with excess cardiovascular risk [6] it is recognised that other visceral adipose tissue deposits also contribute [7]. The conclusion therefore that hepatic steatosis defined by the fatty liver index is an *independent* risk factor for carotid atherosclerosis is questionable.

The evaluation of hepatic steatosis using the fatty liver index also provides a potentially useful insight into the clinical importance of NAFLD in cardiovascular risk prediction. Assuming that waist circumference is a good surrogate of hepatic steatosis one might expect that waist circumference would provide additional, clinically important information in wider studies of cardiovascular risk. This is not the case. In a large individual patient data analysis of 58 studies, including 221,934 patients with 1.87 million person-years of follow-up from the Emerging Risk Factors Collaboration, waist circumference was associated with cardiovascular risk independently of the major known risk factors (age, gender, and smoking status) [8]. That association was attenuated but persisted following further adjustment for factors including systolic blood pressure, presence of diabetes, and high density lipoprotein (HDL) cholesterol concentrations. Importantly however when waist circumference was added to risk prediction models it did not significantly add to the accuracy of these models. This suggests,

providing information is available for systolic blood pressure, presence of diabetes, and measures of cholesterol, existing risk prediction models are likely to be applicable to patients with NAFLD and that any additional risk may be encapsulated within these. This hypothesis is supported to some extent by the higher Framingham risk scores reported for patients with NAFLD in a prior study [9].

The hepatology community might accept that there is an increased risk of cardiovascular disease in patients with NAFLD. Further high quality prospective studies should examine the calibration of existing cardiovascular risk prediction models (for example QRISK2 [10]) to determine whether these are applicable to patients with NAFLD rather than focusing on the strength and independence of the association between NAFLD and cardiovascular risk. Any miscalibration seen in such studies would serve to refine existing risk prediction models and thereby improve primary prevention strategies for patients with NAFLD.

Conflict of interest

The authors who have taken part in this study declared that they do not have anything to disclose regarding funding or conflict of interest with respect to this manuscript.

References

- [1] Armstrong MJ, Adams LA, Canbay A, et al. Extrahepatic complications of nonalcoholic fatty liver disease. *Hepatology* 2014;59:1174–1197.
- [2] Adams LA, Lymp JF, St Sauver J, et al. The natural history of nonalcoholic fatty liver disease: a population-based cohort study. *Gastroenterology* 2005;129:113–121.
- [3] Angulo P, Bugianesi E, Bjornsson ES, et al. Simple noninvasive systems predict long-term outcomes of patients with nonalcoholic fatty liver disease. *Gastroenterology* 2013;145:782–789 e4.
- [4] Pais R, Giral P, Khan JF, et al. Fatty liver is an independent predictor of early carotid atherosclerosis. *J Hepatol* 2016;65:95–102.
- [5] Targher G, Byrne CD, Lonardo A, et al. Nonalcoholic fatty liver disease and risk of incident cardiovascular disease: a meta-analysis of observational studies. *J Hepatol* 2016;65:589–600.
- [6] Fabbrini E, Magkos F, Mohammed BS, et al. Intrahepatic fat, not visceral fat, is linked with metabolic complications of obesity. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2009;106:15430–15435.
- [7] Despres JP. Body fat distribution and risk of cardiovascular disease: an update. *Circulation* 2012;126:1301–1313.
- [8] Emerging Risk Factors Collaboration, Wormser D, Kaptoge S, et al. Separate and combined associations of body-mass index and abdominal adiposity with cardiovascular disease: collaborative analysis of 58 prospective studies. *Lancet* 2011;377:1085–1095.
- [9] Treeprasertsuk S, Leverage S, Adams LA, et al. The Framingham risk score and heart disease in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease. *Liver Int* 2012;32:945–950.
- [10] Hippisley-Cox J, Coupland C, Vinogradova Y, et al. Predicting cardiovascular risk in England and Wales: prospective derivation and validation of QRISK2. *BMJ* 2008;336:1475–1482.

C. Ramu Chimakurthi¹
Ian A. Rowe^{1,2,*}

¹Liver Unit, St. James's University Hospital, Leeds, UK
²Leeds Institute for Data Analytics, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK

*Corresponding author. Address: Leeds Institute for Data Analytics, Room 6.12 Level 6, Clinical Sciences Building, University of Leeds, St. James's Hospital, Leeds LS9 7TF, UK.
Tel.: +44 (0)113 206 5667.

E-mail address: i.a.c.rowe@leeds.ac.uk